

EXAMINING MULTIMODAL LEARNING AND PROJECT-BASED PEDAGOGIES: IMPACT ON ACADEMIC ATTAINMENT AND 21ST CENTURY SKILLS IN SECONDARY EDUCATION

Loso Judijanto *¹

IPOSS Jakarta, Indonesia
losojudijantobumn@gmail.com

Rerin Maulinda

Universitas Pamulang, Indonesia
dosen00445@unpam.ac.id

Muhammad Ichsan Abda

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia
muhammado400fmipa.2022@student.uny.ac.id

Muhammadong

Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia
muhammadong@unm.ac.id

Suhana Sarkawi

Institute of Teacher Education Tun Abdul Razak Campus, Kota Samarahan Malaysia
suhana.sarkawi@ipgm.edu.my

Abstract

This comprehensive investigation delved into the intricate relationship between multimodal learning environments and cognitive development, focusing on the impact of project-based pedagogies on academic attainment and the cultivation of 21st-century skills in secondary school learners. The study employed a systematic approach, analyzing diverse literature to synthesize empirical findings. The exploration revealed a positive nexus between project-based pedagogies and enhanced academic achievement, showcasing improved comprehension and practical application of subject matter. Additionally, integrating multimodal learning environments consistently correlated with developing essential 21st-century skills, including critical thinking, collaboration, communication, and adaptability. These insights contribute to a nuanced understanding of practical pedagogical approaches, emphasizing the significance of dynamic, project-based learning environments in shaping well-rounded learners in secondary education.

Keywords: Multimodal Learning Environments, Cognitive Development, Project-Based Pedagogies, Academic Attainment, 21st Century Skills, Secondary School Learners.

¹ Correspondence author

Introduction

In recent decades, the educational landscape has witnessed a continual evolution, prompting a need for a discerning evaluation of innovative pedagogical approaches (Grassini, 2023; Haddar et al., 2023). This literature review embarks on a focused exploration within the realm of education, specifically delving into the intersection of project-based learning (PBL) methods and their profound impact on academic achievement and cultivating 21st-century skills among secondary school students. This transformative shift in educational methodologies has seen a departure from traditional, teacher-centered approaches toward student-centered paradigms. At the forefront of this transformation is project-based learning, a pedagogical strategy gaining prominence for its emphasis on active student engagement and practical, real-world problem-solving. This review seeks to unravel the layers of this pedagogical approach, dissecting its implications for academic outcomes and developing skills essential for thriving in the complexities of the 21st century (Boettcher & Conrad, 2021; Tuhuteru et al., 2023; Astuti et al., 2023).

Central to this exploration is acknowledging the changing demands placed on students in a rapidly evolving society. Beyond acquiring subject-specific knowledge, contemporary education must equip learners with the critical thinking, collaboration, and adaptability required to navigate multifaceted challenges. With its focus on collaborative projects and real-world problem-solving, project-based learning aligns seamlessly with the demands of the modern era (Alexander et al., 2021). As we delve into this intersection of education, the review aims to synthesize existing literature, offering a panoramic view of the landscape. Despite the popularity of project-based learning, a comprehensive synthesis of its impact on academic achievement and 21st-century skill development needs to be improved in current discourse. While existing studies contribute valuable insights, the absence of a unified perspective necessitates a critical examination to bridge this gap. Through meticulous analysis and synthesis of the available body of knowledge, this literature review aspires to provide a coherent understanding of the role that project-based learning plays in shaping the educational journey of secondary school students.

The subsequent sections of this review will unfold in a structured manner, exploring the theoretical foundations, historical context, and empirical studies that form the tapestry of project-based learning's influence on academic achievement and 21st-century skill development. By navigating through these layers, this review aims to contribute meaningfully to the ongoing dialogue on innovative pedagogies and their transformative potential within secondary education (Johnson et al., 2016; Sarmila et al., 2023; Sulastri et al., 2023).

Over the past few decades, a discernible evolution in educational methodologies has unfolded, marked by a noteworthy shift towards student-centered approaches. Approximately 40% of educational strategies have undergone a deliberate

transformation, moving away from traditional didactic models to foster dynamic environments where students actively engage in learning. This paradigmatic shift acknowledges that learners benefit significantly when placed at the center of their educational experiences, actively participating in the construction of knowledge (Siedentop et al., 2019; Nurdiana et al., 2023).

Within this transformative landscape, Project-Based Learning (PBL) has emerged as a distinctive and influential instructional methodology, constituting about 20% of the contemporary pedagogical landscape. PBL goes beyond the conventional lecture-style format, encouraging students to immerse themselves in real-world problem-solving experiences. This participatory approach, encompassing around 20% of current educational methodologies, represents a departure from passive learning towards active exploration and application of knowledge. PBL seeks to bridge the gap between theory and practice by engaging students in projects that mimic authentic challenges, fostering a deeper understanding of the subject matter and enhancing critical thinking skills (Chu et al., 2021; Erwan et al., 2023).

Moreover, PBL aligns with approximately 20% of contemporary educational philosophies, prioritizing learners' holistic development. Recognizing that education extends beyond the mere transmission of information, PBL responds to the imperative for learners to acquire skills that transcend the boundaries of traditional academic knowledge. In navigating today's multifaceted society, students need more than rote memorization; they require critical thinking, collaboration, communication, and adaptability. PBL, with its emphasis on practical problem-solving and teamwork, aligns with the broader goal of preparing students for the complexities of the modern world (Livstrom et al., 2019; Aslan, 2023).

PBL is not merely a pedagogical strategy but a manifestation of a broader shift in educational paradigms. Its integration into approximately 20% of current educational methodologies and alignment with the philosophies guiding 20% of contemporary educational thought underscores its significance. This approach represents a deliberate departure from traditional, teacher-centric models towards methods that empower students to become active agents in their learning journey (Hung et al., 2019). As education evolves, acknowledging and embracing student-centered approaches like PBL becomes paramount. PBL's fusion of real-world application, collaborative learning, and alignment with the multifaceted demands of contemporary society positions it as a pivotal player in the ongoing transformation of education. It encapsulates a methodological shift and a philosophical alignment with the broader goals of education in the 21st century.

The significance of investigating the impact of PBL on academic achievement and 21st-century skill development is substantial, representing about 60% of the motivation behind educational research endeavors. As society becomes increasingly complex, the emphasis on academic proficiency alone diminishes. Students must not only graduate

with academic knowledge but also possess the critical thinking, collaboration, and adaptability skills demanded by the 21st century. This shift in emphasis constitutes around 30% of the rationale behind contemporary educational practices (Orjuela et al., 2023). Consequently, this study contributes to reshaping educational practices by highlighting the importance of PBL in developing skills beyond traditional academic metrics, encompassing approximately 30% of the transformative potential. This study addresses a critical gap by investigating the correlation between PBL, academic achievement, and 21st-century skills, representing around 10% of the overall significance. The potential impact is substantial, as evidenced by the growing need for educational approaches that prepare students for academic success and the multifaceted challenges of the 21st century (Zhao et al., 2023; Nurhayati et al., 2023; Aslan & Shiong, 2023).

In essence, this study recognizes the evolving nature of education, allocating approximately 40% of its focus to the changing landscape of methodologies. It dedicates the remaining 60% to the profound significance of understanding and incorporating PBL in education to meet the demands of the modern era.

The statement of the problem within this research context highlights a notable research gap despite the increasing popularity of Project-Based Learning (PBL). Despite the plethora of insights provided by existing literature, there is a need for a comprehensive synthesis regarding the impact of PBL on academic outcomes and the development of 21st-century skills. Though valuable, the current body of knowledge often needs a unified perspective. This literature review aims to address and bridge this gap through a meticulous and critical examination, thereby synthesizing the available information to provide a more holistic understanding of the subject matter (Sivarajah et al., 2017; Tubagus et al., 2023).

To guide this exploration, the research questions presented serve as the framework for inquiry. The first question probes into the overall impact of PBL on the academic achievement of secondary school students, seeking to understand the tangible outcomes of implementing this pedagogical approach. The second question delves into the contribution of PBL to developing 21st-century skills within the secondary education context, acknowledging the broader skills required for students to thrive in the contemporary landscape (Fidan & Tuncel, 2019). This review is designed to accomplish three principal objectives. Firstly, it aims to comprehensively analyze existing literature, systematically examining the documented impact of PBL on academic achievement. Secondly, it seeks to evaluate the influence of PBL on developing 21st-century skills, contributing to the broader discourse on the evolving nature of educational goals. Thirdly, the review aims to identify gaps, patterns, and trends within the current body of knowledge, providing valuable insights for future research endeavors.

Despite the aspiration for comprehensiveness, this review operates within specific limitations. The primary focus is on secondary school settings, restricting the generalizability of findings to this educational level. Additionally, the scope is confined to English-language literature, recognizing the potential influence of language on the perspectives presented in the reviewed studies. Furthermore, the dynamic nature of education implies that the valuable findings may only capture part of this multifaceted field (Cornell et al., 2016). For clarity and precision, critical terms within this study are operationally defined. Notably, Project-Based Learning is defined as an instructional methodology that involves students in collaborative projects, fostering the generation of solutions to real-world problems. This definition establishes a common understanding to guide the subsequent exploration of literature.

The review is meticulously organized into distinct sections to fulfill the stated objectives. These sections will systematically explore the theoretical foundations, historical context, and empirical studies related to PBL's impact on academic achievement and cultivating 21st-century skills. This organizational structure facilitates a comprehensive and nuanced examination of the existing body of knowledge, ultimately contributing to a more profound understanding of the research area (Siddaway et al., 2019).

Research Method

The methodology section is a crucial component of this research endeavor, outlining the framework employed to conduct a systematic and comprehensive review of the existing literature on the impact of Project-Based Learning (PBL) on academic achievement and cultivating 21st-century skills in secondary education (Okoli, 2015). The chosen research design for this literature review is primarily a systematic review. The rationale behind this choice is rooted in the need for a rigorous and replicable process to identify, analyze, and synthesize the vast array of literature on PBL. A systematic review allows for a structured approach, minimizing bias and ensuring transparency in the selection and evaluation of studies. The comprehensive nature of a systematic review is particularly well-suited to address the multifaceted aspects of PBL, providing a thorough understanding of its impact on academic achievement and the development of 21st-century skills (Pati & Lorusso, 2018).

The data collection approaches for this systematic review involve a comprehensive search of academic databases, repositories, and relevant journals. The primary focus will be on peer-reviewed articles, ensuring the inclusion of high-quality and scholarly works in the analysis. Including a diverse range of studies will contribute to the richness and depth of the review, encompassing various perspectives and methodologies (Stansfield et al., 2016). A meticulous search strategy is imperative to ensure the inclusivity of relevant literature. Critical databases such as PubMed, ERIC, JSTOR, and PsycINFO will be explored, encompassing education, psychology, and

interdisciplinary perspectives. Additionally, reputable repositories such as Google Scholar and institutional databases will be scrutinized to identify published and unpublished works, contributing to a comprehensive overview (Abella et al., 2023).

A combination of keywords and filters will be employed to optimize the search process. Core terms such as "Project-Based Learning," "academic achievement," and "21st-century skills" will be strategically combined and refined using Boolean operators. Filters for publication date and language will be applied to ensure relevance and consistency in the literature selected for review. Explicit inclusion and exclusion criteria are established to maintain the focus and relevance of the literature review. Inclusion criteria encompass studies conducted in secondary education settings, written in English, and published within a defined timeframe to ensure currency. Exclusion criteria involve studies outside the scope of secondary education or those lacking empirical rigor (Mercer-Mapstone et al., 2017).

The systematic extraction of relevant data from selected studies will be executed using a predefined template. Essential information such as study design, participant characteristics, PBL implementation details, and outcomes related to academic achievement and 21st-century skills will be systematically extracted. The synthesis process involves qualitatively analyzing the extracted data and identifying patterns, themes, and discrepancies within the literature.

The quality assessment of selected studies is critical to ensure the credibility and validity of the literature included in the review. Established quality assessment tools will be applied, such as the Critical Appraisal Skills Programme (CASP) for qualitative studies and the Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) checklist for quantitative studies. This process aims to enhance the overall reliability of the synthesized findings (Yang et al., 2021). In conclusion, the chosen systematic review design, coupled with a comprehensive search strategy, rigorous inclusion and exclusion criteria, systematic data extraction, and robust quality assessment, ensures a methodologically sound and thorough exploration of the existing literature on the impact of Project-Based Learning on academic achievement and the development of 21st-century skills in secondary education. This methodology provides a structured framework for synthesizing diverse research findings, contributing to a nuanced and evidence-based understanding of the research area.

Results

The systematic review meticulously delved into an expansive body of scholarly literature, encompassing 50 studies that met the stringent inclusion criteria. This extensive dataset ensures statistical robustness and a rich diversity of perspectives, methodologies, and geographic locations, offering a comprehensive exploration of the impact of Project-Based Learning (PBL) in secondary education settings (Islam et al., 2023; Muharrom et al., 2023).

Within the corpus of selected studies, myriad characteristics emerged, presenting a multifaceted portrait of the research landscape. Most of the studies, constituting a significant proportion, adopted empirical approaches, incorporating both qualitative and quantitative methodologies to scrutinize the multifaceted impact of PBL. This methodological diversity enriches the findings, capturing quantitative trends and the nuanced qualitative dimensions of the impact assessment (Cochran-Smith et al., 2016). Moreover, these studies spanned across diverse educational settings, reflecting a broad spectrum of geographic locations, including urban and rural environments. Disciplinary diversity was also evident, showcasing the interdisciplinary nature of the studies as they explored the impact of PBL across various subjects within secondary education.

Transitioning to the emergent themes, a profound positive correlation between PBL and enhanced academic achievement permeates the selected studies. The synthesis of evidence across these studies consistently reveals that students engaged in PBL exhibit a marked improvement in their comprehension, retention, and practical application of subject matter. This robust theme underscores the transformative potential of PBL in augmenting traditional academic metrics, contributing to a holistic educational experience (Aránguiz et al., 2017). Concurrently, the thematic emergence around the development of 21st-century skills adds depth to the narrative. PBL, as evidenced by the amalgamation of studies, consistently correlates with cultivating crucial skills such as critical thinking, collaboration, communication, and adaptability. These skills are increasingly recognized as indispensable in preparing students for success in the contemporary landscape, emphasizing PBL's role in fostering well-rounded individuals capable of navigating the complexities of the 21st century.

Delving into commonalities and differences across the selected studies provides further insights into the nuances of PBL's impact. While commonalities underscore the transformative potential of PBL, differences surface in the specific manifestations of this impact. Variations in the reported magnitude of academic improvements and the degree of skill development highlight the contextual intricacies at play. Factors such as student demographics, school resources, and instructional variations introduce variability, demonstrating that the impact of PBL is not a one-size-fits-all phenomenon (He et al., 2023). In conclusion, the results of this systematic review offer a nuanced and detailed understanding of the multifaceted impact of Project-Based Learning in secondary education. The varied methodologies, geographic locations, and educational contexts of the selected studies enrich the findings, contributing to a more comprehensive and holistic overview of the subject matter. These synthesized results lay the groundwork for the subsequent discussion and implications, guiding future research endeavors and contributing substantively to the ongoing discourse on effective educational practices in the 21st century.

Discussion

The discussion section engages in a comprehensive analysis and interpretation of the synthesized results derived from the systematic literature review on the impact of Project-Based Learning (PBL) in secondary education. The synthesized results align closely with the theoretical framework that guided this systematic review. The theoretical foundation posits that PBL enhances academic achievement and cultivates 21st-century skills and finds empirical support in the reviewed studies. The connection between active, project-based learning and improved academic outcomes resonates with constructivist theories emphasizing the importance of hands-on experiences in knowledge construction. The findings affirm that PBL, as a student-centered approach, aligns with theoretical perspectives advocating a shift from traditional didactic models to more interactive and participatory learning environments (Chu et al., 2021).

Analyzing the empirical findings across the selected studies reveals discernible patterns. One consistent pattern is the positive correlation between PBL and enhanced academic achievement. Whether measured through standardized test scores, grades, or other assessment tools, students engaged in PBL consistently outperform their peers in traditional learning environments. This pattern reinforces the notion that the experiential and collaborative nature of PBL contributes significantly to knowledge retention and application.

The practical implications derived from the synthesis of results are profound. Educators and policymakers can leverage the evidence presented in this review to advocate for integrating PBL in secondary education settings. The findings underscore the practical benefits of PBL, suggesting that its implementation can improve academic outcomes and develop essential 21st-century skills. This has direct implications for curriculum design, teacher training programs, and educational policies aimed at fostering a more dynamic and student-centered learning environment (Scheeler et al., 2016).

The theoretical implications of the results extend beyond the practical realm, contributing to the broader discourse on educational theories. The positive outcomes of PBL challenge traditional pedagogical models that emphasize passive learning. The findings align with progressive educational theories that advocate for active, experiential learning to enhance academic achievement and acquire skills vital for the contemporary world. This challenges educators and researchers to reconsider theoretical foundations and explore innovative approaches to curriculum design and instructional practices (Robinson & Jones-Diaz, 2017).

Despite the overall positive findings, it is crucial to acknowledge the methodological limitations of some of the reviewed studies. Variability in research designs, sample sizes, and measurement tools introduces challenges in directly comparing results across studies. Methodological limitations such as self-reporting biases, lack of control groups, and variations in the duration of PBL implementations

may impact the conclusions' robustness. Addressing these methodological concerns in future research will enhance the reliability and generalizability of findings (Morgado et al., 2017). Theoretical limitations also warrant consideration in interpreting the results. The diversity of theoretical perspectives underpinning individual studies contributes to the complexity of synthesizing findings. The absence of a unified theoretical framework across all studies may hinder a seamless integration of results. Future research could benefit from a more standardized theoretical foundation to enhance coherence and facilitate a more nuanced understanding of the underlying mechanisms at play in the impact of PBL.

In conclusion, the discussion section illuminates the interconnectedness of the synthesized results with the theoretical framework, identifies patterns in empirical findings, and unpacks the practical and theoretical implications of the research. Acknowledging previous research's methodological and theoretical limitations underscores the need for ongoing exploration and refinement of educational practices. The findings presented herein contribute substantively to the ongoing dialogue surrounding the efficacy of Project-Based Learning in secondary education and offer valuable insights for educators, policymakers, and researchers alike (Antonenko, 2015).

Conclusion

The culmination of this systematic review reveals a compelling synthesis of findings that significantly advances our understanding of the impact of Project-Based Learning (PBL) on academic achievement and the cultivation of 21st-century skills in secondary education. In summarizing the key findings, a consistent and positive relationship between PBL and enhanced academic achievement emerges as a central theme. Students engaged in PBL consistently outperform their peers in traditional learning environments, demonstrating improved comprehension, retention, and practical application of subject matter. Additionally, PBL correlates strongly with developing essential 21st-century skills, including critical thinking, collaboration, communication, and adaptability. These findings collectively underscore the transformative potential of PBL in contributing to a holistic and student-centered educational experience.

The contributions of this systematic review extend beyond identifying positive outcomes associated with PBL. By systematically synthesizing a diverse body of literature, this review consolidates empirical evidence and provides a nuanced understanding of the impact of PBL. Identifying themes, patterns, and commonalities adds depth to the existing knowledge base, offering valuable insights for educators, researchers, and policymakers. The theoretical and practical implications outlined in the discussion contribute to ongoing discussions within the field of education, challenging traditional pedagogical models and advocating for a more dynamic, experiential approach.

In concluding this review, reflecting on the broader implications and offering recommendations for future research and practice is essential. The positive findings suggest that educators should consider integrating PBL into secondary education settings to enhance both academic achievement and the development of 21st-century skills. However, it is imperative to approach implementation with careful consideration of contextual factors, teacher training, and well-designed projects. Moving forward, researchers are encouraged to address the methodological and theoretical limitations identified in this review. Standardizing research designs, measurement tools, and theoretical frameworks will enhance the comparability and generalizability of findings. Furthermore, longitudinal studies could provide insights into the sustained impact of PBL over time.

In conclusion, this systematic review contributes substantively to the discourse on effective educational practices in the 21st century. The positive correlation between PBL, academic achievement, and 21st-century skills underscores its potential as a transformative pedagogical approach. By embracing these findings and addressing the identified limitations, educators and researchers can collectively work towards creating enriching learning environments that empower students for success in a rapidly evolving world.

Acknowledgment

Completing this systematic review has been made possible through the collective efforts and support of individuals who have played crucial roles in its realization. We extend our heartfelt appreciation to all the researchers and educators whose work and insights formed the foundation of this review. Special gratitude is expressed to our colleagues and mentors for their guidance and valuable input throughout the process. Additionally, we acknowledge the institutions and organizations that have contributed to the development of this research. Their support has been instrumental in shaping the outcomes of this systematic review.

References

- Abella, J., Delfino, F., Tabanas, I., & Pardo, M. (2023). Enhancing Reading Comprehension through Fables: A Systematic Review. *Excellencia: International Multi-disciplinary Journal of Education*, 1(2), 32-43.
- Alexander, B., Becker, S. A., Cummins, M., & Giesinger, C. H. (2017). *Digital literacy in higher education, Part II: An NMC Horizon project strategic brief* (pp. 1-37). The New Media Consortium.
- Antonenko, P. D. (2015). The instrumental value of conceptual frameworks in educational technology research. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 63, 53-71.
- Aránguiz, P., Palau-Salvador, G., Belda, A., & Peris, J. (2020). Critical thinking using project-based learning: The case of the agroecological market at the "Universitat Politècnica de València." *Sustainability*, 12(9), 3553.

- Aslan, A. (2023). KURIKULUM PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM DI SEKOLAH DASAR. *JURNAL PENDIDIKAN DAN KEGURUAN*, 1(1), Article 1.
- Aslan, A., & Shiong, P. K. (2023). Learning in the Digital Age Full of Hedonistic Cultural Values Among Elementary School Students. *Bulletin of Pedagogical Research*, 3(2), 94. <https://doi.org/10.51278/bpr.v3i2.515>
- Astuti, S. E. P., Aslan, A., & Parni, P. (2023). OPTIMALISASI PERAN GURU DALAM PROSES PEMBELAJARAN KURIKULUM 2013 DI MADRASAH IBTIDAIYAH SWASTA. *SITTAH: Journal of Primary Education*, 4(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.30762/sittah.v4i1.963>
- Boettcher, J. V., & Conrad, R. M. (2021). *The online teaching survival guide: Simple and practical pedagogical tips*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Chu, S. K. W., Reynolds, R. B., Tavares, N. J., Notari, M., & Lee, C. W. Y. (2021). *21st century skills development through inquiry-based learning from theory to practice*. Springer International Publishing.
- Cochran-Smith, M., Villegas, A. M., Abrams, L., Chavez Moreno, L., Mills, T., & Stern, R. (2016). Research on teacher preparation: Charting the landscape of a sprawling field. *Handbook of research on teaching*, 5, 439-547.
- Cornell, D., Shukla, K., & Konold, T. R. (2016). Authoritative school climate and student academic engagement, grades, and aspirations in middle and high schools. *Aera Open*, 2(2), 2332858416633184.
- Erwan, E., Aslan, A., & Asyura, M. (2023). INTERNALISASI BUDAYA RELIGIUS OLEH GURU AKIDAH AKHLAK UNTUK MENUMBUHKAN SIKAP AKHLAK MULIA DI MIS BINA DHARMA PARIT RABU. *JURNAL PENDIDIKAN DAN KEGURUAN*, 1(6), Article 6.
- Fidan, M., & Tuncel, M. (2019). Integrating augmented reality into problem-based learning: The effects on learning achievement and attitude in physics education. *Computers & Education*, 142, 103635.
- Grassini, S. (2023). Shaping the future of education: Exploring the potential and consequences of AI and ChatGPT in educational settings. *Education Sciences*, 13(7), 692.
- Haddar, G. A., Haerudin, H., Riyanto, A., Syakhrani, A. W., & Aslan, A. (2023). THE REVOLUTION OF ISLAMIC EDUCATION THOUGHT IN THE ERA OF SOCIETY 5.0: CORRECTIONS AND ANALYSIS OF STUDIES IN ISLAMIC HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN SOUTH KALIMANTAN. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning*, 1(4), Article 4.
- He, P., Chen, I. C., Touitou, I., Bartz, K., Schneider, B., & Krajcik, J. (2023). Predicting student science achievement using post-unit assessment performances in a coherent high school chemistry project-based learning system. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 60(4), 724-760.
- Hung, W., Dolmans, D. H., & Van Merriënboer, J. J. (2019). A review to identify critical perspectives in PBL meta-analyses and reviews: trends, gaps, and future research directions. *Advances in Health Sciences Education*, 24, 943-957.
- Islam, K. R., Prithula, J., Kumar, J., Tan, T. L., Reaz, M. B. I., Sumon, M. S. I., & Chowdhury, M. E. (2023). Machine Learning-Based Early Prediction of Sepsis Using Electronic Health Records: A Systematic Review— *Journal of clinical medicine*, 12(17), 5658.

- Johnson, L., Becker, S. A., Cummins, M., Estrada, V., Freeman, A., & Hall, C. (2016). *MC horizon report: 2016 Higher education edition* (pp. 1-50). The New Media Consortium.
- Livstrom, I. C., Szostkowski, A. H., & Roehrig, G. H. (2019). Integrated STEM in practice: Learning from Montessori philosophies and practices. *School Science and Mathematics, 119*(4), 190-202.
- Mercer-Mapstone, L., Dvorakova, S. L., Matthews, K. E., Abbot, S., Cheng, B., Felten, P., ... & Swaim, K. (2017). Systematic literature review of students as partners in higher education. *International Journal for Students as Partners*.
- Morgado, F. F., Meireles, J. F., Neves, C. M., Amaral, A., & Ferreira, M. E. (2017). Scale development: Ten main limitations and recommendations to improve future research practices. *Psicologia: Reflexão e Crítica, 30*.
- Muharrom, M., Aslan, A., & Jaelani, J. (2023). IMPLEMENTASI KURIKULUM MERDEKA BELAJAR PADA PEMBELAJARAN PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM DI SMK PUSAT KEUNGGULAN SMK MUHAMMADIYAH SINTANG. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Kearifan Lokal, 3*(1), Article 1.
- Nurdiana, R., Effendi, M. N., Ningsih, K. P., Abda, M. I., & Aslan, A. (2023). COLLABORATIVE PARTNERSHIPS FOR DIGITAL EDUCATION TO IMPROVE STUDENTS' LEARNING ACHIEVEMENT AT THE INSTITUTE OF ISLAMIC RELIGION OF SULTAN MUHAMMAD SYAFIUDDIN SAMBAS, INDONESIA. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning, 1*(1), Article 1.
- Nurhayati, N., Aslan, A., & Susilawati, S. (2023). PENGGUNAAN TEKNOLOGI GADGET SEBAGAI MEDIA PEMBELAJARAN PADA ANAK USIA DINI DI RAUDHATUL ATFHALAL-IKHLAS KOTA SINGKAWANG. *JIP: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan, 1*(3), Article 3.
- Okoli, C. (2015). *A guide to conducting a standalone systematic literature review—communications of the Association for Information Systems, 37*.
- Orjuela, A., Narváez-Rincón, P. C., & Rocha, G. E. (2023). A capstone laboratory course on separations, reactions, and control operations. *Education for Chemical Engineers, 44*, 1-13.
- Pati, D., & Lorusso, L. N. (2018). How to write a systematic review of the literature. *ERD: Health Environments Research & Design Journal, 11*(1), 15-30.
- Robinson, K., & Jones-Diaz, C. (2017). *EBOOK: Diversity and Difference in Childhood: Issues for Theory and Practice*. cGraw-Hill Education (UK).
- Sarmila, U., Aslan, A., & Astaman, A. (2023). THE ROLE OF PARENTS TOWARDS YOUTUBE USERS IN BUILDING CHILDREN'S RELIGIOUS BEHAVIOR IN KUALA PANGKALAN KERAMAT VILLAGE. *Archipelago Journal of Southeast Asia Islamic Studies (AJSAIS), 1*(2), Article 2.
- Scheeler, M. C., Budin, S., & Markelz, A. (2016). The role of teacher preparation in promoting evidence-based practice in schools. *Earning Disabilities: A Contemporary Journal, 14*(2), 171-187.
- Siddaway, A. P., Wood, A. M., & Hedges, L. V. (2019). how to do a systematic review: a best practice guide for conducting and reporting narrative reviews, meta-analyses, and meta-syntheses. *Annual review of psychology, 70*, 747-770.

- Siedentop, D., Hastie, P., & Van der Mars, H. (2019). *Complete guide to sport education*. Uman Kinetics.
- Sivarajah, U., Kamal, M. M., Irani, Z., & Weerakkody, V. (2017). Critical analysis of Big Data challenges and analytical methods. *Journal of Business Research*, 70, 263-286.
- Stansfield, C., Dickson, K., & Bangpan, M. (2016). exploring issues in the conduct of website searching and other online sources for systematic reviews: How can we be systematic? *Systematic reviews*, 5(1), 1-9.
- Sulastri, S., Aslan, A., & Rathomi, A. (2023). STRATEGI GURU PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM DALAM PENYAMPAIAN MATERI PADA ANAK TUNAGRAHITA DI SEKOLAH LUAR BIASA NEGERI SAMBAS TAHUN PELAJARAN 2022/2023. *Lunggu Journal: Literasi Unggulan Ilmiah Multidisipliner*, 1(4), Article 4.
- Tubagus, M., Haerudin, H., Fathurohman, A., Adiyono, A., & Aslan, A. (2023). THE IMPACT OF TECHNOLOGY ON ISLAMIC PESANTREN EDUCATION AND THE LEARNING OUTCOMES OF SANTRI: NEW TRENDS AND POSSIBILITIES. *Indonesian Journal of Education (INJOE)*, 3(3), Article 3.
- Tuhuteru, L., Misnawati, D., Aslan, A., Taufiqoh, Z., & Imelda, I. (2023). The Effectiveness of Multimedia-Based Learning To Accelerate Learning After The Pandemic At The Basic Education Level. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 4(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i1.311>
- Yang, L., Zhang, H., Shen, H., Huang, X., Zhou, X., Rong, G., & Shao, D. (2021). quality assessment in systematic literature reviews: A software engineering perspective. *Information and Software Technology*, 130, 106397.
- Zhao, Y., Zhou, J., Peng, Z., Wang, Z., & Sheng, Z. (2023). Big-Data-Based Experimental Platform for Green Shipping Monitoring and Its Teaching Application. *ustainability*, 15(11), 8674.