

IMPLEMENTATION OF SERVICE EXCELLENCE IN HIGHER EDUCATION TO INCREASE STUDENT SATISFACTION AS CUSTOMERS: A CASE STUDY OF A PRIVATE UNIVERSITY IN JAKARTA

Ihin Solihin

Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Administrasi (STIA) Banten, INDONESIA

Email : ihin.solihin@stiabanten.ac.id

Abstract

Every educational institution must of course have quality and qualified Human Resources (HR). Not only the teaching staff or lecturers, but also need to be supported by competent staff/educational staff so that the "consumers" we serve can achieve maximum satisfaction. In the world of higher education, the consumers referred to here can be students, parents or other parties who collaborate with the university in question. However, considering that almost all activities in higher education are always related to students, the concept of excellent service must also focus on the needs of the students themselves. This research is aimed at answering the question of how excellent service is implemented at XYZ private university and whether the services from the university provide satisfaction to its students. Data collection was carried out using semi-structured interviews with 10 students who were studying in the first semester and 10 other students who had been studying for up to 6 semesters. This classification of informants was carried out to obtain an idea of whether there were differences between the services provided to new students and old students. Apart from that, to see whether there have been any changes made towards better service for students as customers. The results of this research indicate that the A6 aspect of excellent service has not been implemented properly so that it does not provide satisfaction to students who are customers or clients which is very important for the sustainability of a higher education institution.

Keywords: Service excellence, higher education, student satisfaction.

INTRODUCTION

The increase in the number of Universities in Indonesia shows that the education system in Indonesia is increasingly developing. This development certainly brings positive things to society where access to higher education will become easier. According to Law no. 20 of 2003 article 1 paragraph 1 concerning the National Education System explains that education is a conscious and planned effort to create a learning atmosphere and learning process so that students actively develop their potential to have religious spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character. as well as the skills possessed by himself, society and the country. According to the Indonesian Statistics report, in 2021 there will be 3,115 universities in Indonesia, consisting of 2,990 units being private universities and 125 units being state universities. Handayani, Keban, & Ratminto (2003) stated that Higher Education is an organization that involves various elements, one of which is human resources (HR).

Because private universities still depend on students for operational costs such as building facilities, paying lecturer honorariums, and educational development, private universities must apply the concept of excellent service in the education sector. This is important to maintain student trust and satisfaction with the academic services provided.

The teaching and learning process is an important part of achieving educational goals (Tanjung, 2019). Students must get what they need because they are the main stakeholders in higher education. Therefore, student expectations must be in accordance with the goals, vision and mission of higher education. This harmony will be achieved when learning services prioritize quality, adequate facilities and good management (Amin, 2017). The ability of universities to meet student needs by providing the best possible service will determine the success of education in higher education because student satisfaction is a measure of an institution's success in serving its customers (Fitriana, 2019).

When students feel satisfied and their needs are met beyond their expectations, their trust in the campus will increase. On the other hand, if their needs and expectations are not met, students will be disappointed, which will result in losses and reduce public trust in higher education. Higher education institutions must provide high quality services so that students feel satisfied with what they get (Nurrohmah, 2023). Therefore, excellent service that can satisfy students' needs and conditions is needed to support and motivate them (Ayuni, 2011). Because students are not only customers but also consumers of higher education institutions, universities must have the ability to ensure the quality of education and academic services (Ratnasari, 2016).

One of the private universities in the city of Jakarta is XYZ University, which based on initial studies found many complaints from students regarding the services provided by the university. Complaints are not only limited to service in the academic division, such as the process of correcting grades which is quite long, applying for supplementary exams which also takes a long time to respond, officers who are not friendly and pay little attention to their appearance and there are still many officers who wear sandals when inside the campus building. So, it seems less professional and less respectful of students as clients.

This research is aimed at answering the question of how service excellence is implemented at XYZ University, and whether the service provided provides satisfaction to students. The results of this research will contribute to universities in Indonesia so they can improve the quality of their services.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Understanding Service Excellence

Excellent service is caring for customers by providing the best service to facilitate ease in fulfilling customer needs and realizing satisfaction so that they are always loyal to the organization or company (Barata, 2003).

Kasmir (2018) defines service as the actions or actions of a person or organization to provide satisfaction to customers or fellow employees. In this case, the types of services can be divided into 2 groups, namely internal services or services provided between employees and leaders or between fellow employees within the company, and external services, namely services provided to clients or customers (Kashmir, 2018). Meanwhile, Barata explains that service is an activity or sequence of activities that occurs in direct

interaction between a person and another person or physical machine, and provides customer satisfaction (Atmadjati, 2018).

According to the views of Nizar and Soleh 2017, excellent service called communication or Excellent Service is the application of communication to support actions or actions to customers what they expect when they need them, in the way they want. This is done in order to create good relationships so that mutual prosperity can be achieved and maintain satisfaction, comfort and integrity (values) of the company itself. Meanwhile, according to Suminar and Apriliawati (2017), excellent service provides the first impression until the end in serving guests. With this system, it can be used by all parties in making decisions and simplifying the operational activities of a company. So that the company can run quickly, easily, effectively and efficiently in monitoring its performance. One of the skills that must be possessed is knowledge about the meaning of service and someone who serves must master the etiquette in receiving guests either in person or via electronic media (email, telephone).

According to Majid's view (2011; p, 61) explains more specifically how important service excellence is to customers for several reasons, namely: a. Customers judge the company's efficiency through the employees they meet. b. The first impression (positive first impression) is very important. It's really hard to overcome a negative first impression c. The company has high expectations and standards from its workers. d. Customers trust the company and will continue to enjoy being served if they are treated well. e. One of the most effective forms of advertising is "Word of Mouth" (word of mouth promotion). If a customer is happy, he will tell others. f. We feel happy and proud of ourselves if we provide the best service to customers g. Customers trust us as their primary source of information and assistance.

According to Barata (2014:30) excellent service culture based on A6,:

1. Abilities

Abilities are certain knowledge and skills that are absolutely necessary to support excellent service programs, which include abilities in the field of work pursued, carrying out effective communication, developing motivation, and using public relations as an instrument in building relationships within and outside the organization.

2. Attitude.

Attitude is behavior or behavior that must be emphasized when dealing with users. Attitude is a relatively long-lasting collection of feelings, beliefs and behavioral tendencies directed towards certain people, ideas, objects and groups of people (Eagly and Himmerfalb, in Barata 2003). The conclusion is drawn that attitudes include three aspects, namely beliefs and considerations (cognitive aspects), feelings (affective aspects), and behavioral tendencies.

3. Appearance

Appearance is a person's appearance, whether physical or non-physical, which is able to reflect the confidence and credibility of other parties. Appearance is a

combination of a person's physical appearance and appearance style which will color a person's behavior.

4. Attention

Attention is full concern for customers/users, both in relation to paying attention to users' needs and desires and understanding their suggestions and criticism. By giving full special attention to users, our relationship with users will get better.

5. Action

Actions are various concrete activities that must be carried out in providing services to users. An action is an action or something done to achieve a certain goal or to produce something. What is meant by service actions are concrete efforts or actions aimed at providing reasonable service or good service (genuine service), which of course can be achieved if the service provider has a sense of service attitude by prioritizing attention which is supported by service ability and good service appearance.

6. Accountability

Accountability is an attitude of siding with users as a form of concern to avoid or minimize losses or user dissatisfaction.

Understanding Customer Satisfaction

Satisfaction comes from the Latin words "satis" (meaning good enough, adequate) and "facio" (doing or making). In simple terms, satisfaction can be interpreted as an effort to fulfill something or make something adequate. However, viewed from a consumer behavior perspective, the term consumer satisfaction becomes something complex (Tjiptono, 2007).

According to Kotler and Keller (2007) consumer satisfaction is a person's feeling of happiness or disappointment that arises after comparing the performance (results) of a product in mind against the expected performance (results). If performance is below expectations, customers are dissatisfied. If performance exceeds expectations, the customer is satisfied. If performance exceeds expectations, the customer is very satisfied. Kotler said that consumer satisfaction is the level of a person's feelings after comparing the performance or results he feels with expectations (Kotler, 2002). Meanwhile, Richard F. Gerson defines consumer satisfaction as the consumer's perception that their expectations have been met or exceeded (Gerson, 2002). Meanwhile, according to Irawan, consumer satisfaction is the result of the accumulation of consumers or customers in using products and services. Consumers are satisfied if after purchasing the product, it turns out the product quality is good. Therefore, every new transaction or experience will have an influence on consumer satisfaction. Satisfied consumers are consumers who will share their taste and experience with other consumers (Irawan, 2008).

According to Zeithaml, Parasuraman and Berry quoted in (Lovelock et al. 2004), the dimensions of consumer satisfaction can be divided into several types, namely: (a). Expectations. The company's ability to provide customization to consumers for a product

or service that consumers want. (b). Perceived delivery of product or service. Ability to provide services to consumers when selling products or services. c. Confirmation or disconfirmation. The company's ability to meet consumer needs with the aim that consumers are not disappointed and feel satisfied with the product or service in accordance with the company's promises or vice versa. (d). Complaining behavior. The company's capacity to explain negative consumer feedback into positive ones.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This is a qualitative research with a case study approach. Through qualitative research, Basrowi & Suwandi (2008: 2) say that researchers can recognize the subject, feel what the subject experiences in everyday life. Qualitative research involves researchers so that they understand the context of the situation and setting of the natural phenomenon being studied. Every phenomenon is something unique, different from others because the context is different. The aim of qualitative research is to understand the conditions of a context by leading to a detailed and in-depth description of the portrait of conditions in a natural context, regarding what actually happens according to what is in the field of study. This qualitative research is of course different from quantitative research, because qualitative research does not use statistics, but uses data collection, analysis, and then interpretation. Usually familiar with the relationship between social and human problems that are interdisciplinary, focus on multi-methods, naturalistic and interpretative (Creswell, 1994). Qualitative research focuses on emphasizing understanding of problems in social life based on realistic conditions or natural settings that are holistic, complex and detailed.

This research uses a case study approach. Case studies are empirical investigations that investigate contemporary phenomena in real-life contexts (Yin, 1981a, 2009). The components in case study research design include (Yin, 2009): 1) Research questions, patterned "how" or "why" 2) Propositions, which are statements that reflect important theoretical issues and will guide researchers in searching for relevant data . Propositions are derived from theory, logic, and/or general knowledge which will guide researchers to remain focused so they will not discuss "everything". 3) Unit of analysis, related to the problem of determining what is meant by a "case" in the research in question. 4) Logic (relationship between data and propositions), explains the research data analysis stage. 5) Criteria (interpretation of findings).

The data collection technique in this research used in-depth interviews. This is intended so that researchers get a detailed picture regarding the feelings of informants, in this case students, about the service they received and whether they were satisfied with what they received. The interview technique used in this research is a semi-structured interview. This type of interview is included in the in-depth interview category, where its implementation is freer than structured interviews. The aim of this type of interview is to find problems more openly, where the party being interviewed is asked for their opinions and ideas. In carrying out interviews, researchers need to listen carefully and record what the informant says (Sugiyono, 2019).

Techniques for achieving data validity in qualitative research (Creswell, 2016), namely: triangulation, namely collecting data not only from one source, utilizing various aspects including data sources, methods, researchers or observers and theory. In this research, the validity of the data uses data source triangulation by checking the data that has been obtained from the main informants, namely 20 students consisting of 10 students who have attended lectures in the first 2 semesters and 10 students who have attended lectures for 6 semesters. This classification of informants was carried out by researchers so that researchers could see whether there were differences in the services provided to new students and old students.

The data analysis technique used in this research is the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldana (2014: 12-14). The components in data analysis by Miles, Huberman and Saldana (2014: 12-13) are as follows: (1) Data condensation. Data condensation refers to the process of selecting, focusing, simplifying, abstracting and transforming data that approaches the entirety of written field notes, interview transcripts, documents and empirical materials. The conclusion is that this data condensation process was obtained after the researcher conducted interviews and obtained written data in the field, which later the interview transcripts were sorted to obtain the research focus required by the researcher; (2) Data display. Data presentation is an organization, unification, and conclusion of information. Data presentation here also helps in understanding the research context because it carries out a more in-depth analysis; (3) Conclusion drawing. Drawing conclusions here is carried out by the researcher from the beginning of the researcher collecting data, such as looking for understanding that does not have a pattern, noting the regularity of explanations, and the flow of cause and effect, at the final stage, summing up all the data obtained by the researcher.

RESULTS

From the results of interviews with informants consisting of 10 students at XYZ University, the following data was obtained:

1. Abilities

The services provided by XYZ University do not show that the officers have good abilities. This can be seen from how they provide services to their students who are their clients or customers. Many complaints from students are not provided with good solutions. However, it gives the impression of stalling for time so the response is very slow. Apart from that, there are still many officers who do not have an understanding of how to provide excellent service. In general, they think that students are their students and are still young, so they don't need to be given special services.

“ The officers on this campus are not skilled enough to provide services. If we find problems related to both academic and non-academic matters, they don't seem to immediately provide a solution. In fact, we had to wait quite a long time to get the answer and when they provided a solution, it didn't seem in our favor.” (UK- Student of 1st Semester)

2. Attitude

The attitude in question includes three aspects, namely beliefs (cognitive aspect), feelings (affective aspect), and behavioral tendencies. In serving students at XYZ University, the officers did not show the attitude they should. Their cognitive aspects do not show that they are broad-minded and have confidence in the information conveyed.

"As an officer at a tertiary institution, XYZ University should provide training to all its staff so that they can change the quality of their services for the better. However, from the time I was in my first semester until my final semester, I didn't see any changes in terms of the officers' behavior." (YU- Student of 8th Semester.

3. Appearance

The officers at XYZ University do not pay attention to their appearance properly. They think that their customers are students so they don't feel the need to pay attention to their appearance like bank employees serving their customers.

"The officials at this university really don't pay attention to appearance. They don't seem to consider us as customers. In fact, many of them only wear sandals every day when working and serving students. This certainly devalues students as clients." (RS- Student of 5th Semester)

4. Attention

In every service, paying attention to customers is the main thing, but the officers at XYZ University do not do this, so that customers, in this case students, feel that they are not cared for.

"In almost all divisions at this university, the officers who provide services pay little attention to students. I once filed a complaint because several lecturers were often absent, and it was not uncommon for them not to inform me, so that students had arrived on campus, and there were no lectures. This is very disappointing. However, when I conveyed it to the academic department, there was no change whatsoever." (RZ- Student of 2nd Semester)

5. Action

From several cases experienced by students at XYZ University, it can be seen that the actions taken by officers in providing services to students were not professional. Even though students have submitted complaints, the action taken has taken quite a long time. I don't know why this can happen even though if they are professional, of course the speed factor in providing service must also be taken into account. Apart from that, the actions taken often only think about one-sided benefits.

" The officers at XYZ University, starting from frontliners such as customer service, receptionists, to staff in divisions such as study programs, academics, lecturers, gave the impression that they did not understand what was meant by excellent service. The policies they take often only benefit themselves and are detrimental to students. They don't understand that we are their clients. It is from Us that they can live. But we feel we have never been served well." (AD-Student of 7th Semester)

6. Accountability

From what the officers at XYZ University do, it can be seen that they do not have the responsibility to encourage each individual to carry out their duties in the best possible service. They do not try to give a good image in their service, and they also never feel guilty about what they have given their customers so far.

“ The poor service provided by this university to students reflects that this university does not have accountability or responsibility to carry out its work optimally. And unfortunately, this continues to happen repeatedly year after year. This shows that they have no desire to change and make their institutions better and more professional.” (UN- Student of 4th Semester)

DISCUSSION

From the results of interviews with students who are university customers, data was obtained that the students interviewed were dissatisfied with the services provided by officers at XYZ University. The services provided cannot meet student expectations, such as officers who are not friendly, and seem not to pay attention to what students say. In fact, meeting customer expectations is the main thing in excellent service, as stated by Freddy (2017) that excellent service is the best service in meeting customer expectations and needs.

Apart from fulfilling expectations, students who are customers also hope that officers at the university will improve their ability to provide services to students (expectation) such that the information provided must be detailed, master their work well, and treat customers well (Spencer & Spencer in Mujiasih , 2016). Officers need to broaden their horizons and master the work they are responsible for in order to provide professional services. Unfortunately, from semester 1 to the final semester, students did not see any changes in services at XYZ University. In fact, if an institution wants to improve its reputation, the first thing it must do is change bad service into excellent service that gives a good impression to its customers (perceived delivery service).

Therefore, the company must also have the ability to fulfill its promises in accordance with what was conveyed during promotions or carrying out marketing activities (confirmation). However, what the students felt was a mismatch between what was promised by the university and the services provided. Officials at the university are not responsive to the problems faced by students. They are also not friendly and even seem to not respect students because they only wear sandals when serving students. This is very far from being professional (Lovelock, 2004),

The officers at XYZ University also did not respond quickly to student complaints so students had to wait quite a long time to get a solution (complaining behavior). Likewise, with the policies taken, in general universities only think about policies that benefit themselves. In order to provide excellent service so that students are satisfied, universities need to apply the principle of "few promises, lots of evidence", as stated by Tom Peter in Cook (2004:17).

CONCLUSION

From the analysis that has been carried out, the results of this research indicate that the service provided by XYZ University in Jakarta cannot be said to be excellent service. There are no differences or changes during student studies from the first semester to the final semester. This can be seen from the 6A aspects analyzed by researchers in implementing their services. The ability aspect shows that the officers at XYZ University still do not understand the work they carry out. This is proven by the task of providing services that is not supported by a good appearance, often only wearing sandals inside campus buildings. Apart from that, there is a lack of knowledge and information that must be conveyed to students, especially if there are complaints regarding academic or non-academic problems. From the aspect of attitude and attention, it can be seen that the officers do not have good and professional behavior. In general, officers do not consider students to be clients or customers. Moreover, because students are still relatively younger than officers, the officers who serve them feel that they do not need to be friendly and often do not pay serious attention to any problems faced by students. Such an attitude will lead officers to take unpleasant actions which ultimately shows a lack of accountability. The results of this research analysis also show that students are not satisfied with the services provided by officers at XYZ University.

From the analysis that has been carried out, the results of this research indicate that the service provided by XYZ University in Jakarta cannot be said to be excellent service. There are no differences or changes during student studies from the first semester to the final semester. This can be seen from the 6A aspects analyzed by researchers in implementing their services. The ability aspect shows that the officers at XYZ University still do not understand the work they carry out. This is proven by the task of providing services that is not supported by a good appearance, often only wearing sandals inside campus buildings. Apart from that, there is a lack of knowledge and information that must be conveyed to students, especially if there are complaints regarding academic or non-academic problems. From the aspect of attitude and attention, it can be seen that the officers do not have good and professional behavior. In general, officers do not consider students to be clients or customers. Moreover, because students are still relatively younger than officers, the officers who serve them feel that they do not need to be friendly and often do not pay serious attention to any problems faced by students. Such an attitude will lead officers to take unpleasant actions which ultimately shows a lack of accountability. The results of this research analysis also show that students are not satisfied with the services provided by officers at XYZ University.

REFERENCES

- Amin, S. (2017). Strategi Peningkatan Kualitas Pelayanan Akademik pada Sekolah Tinggi. *Wahana Akademika*, Volume 4 Nomor 2, 193-202.
- Atmadjati, Arista. (2018). *Layanan Prima dalam Praktik Saat Ini*. Yogyakarta: Deepublish.

- Ayu, s. Andira. (2016). *Kepuasan konsumen pada Samudra Jaya Art Photo Bridal Komplek*. 2(1), 56–63.
- Ayuni, D. S. (2011). Pengaruh Motivasi Mahasiswa dan Pelayanan Prima terhadap Kepuasan Mahasiswa Lulusan Program Studi Manajemen Fakultas Ekonomi Universitas Terbuka. *Forum Pascasarjana* Vol. 34 No. 3 Juli, 155-164.
- Barata, A. A., (2003). *Dasar-dasar Pelayanan Prima*. PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama. Jakarta.
- Barata, Adya. (2014). *Dasar- Dasar Pelayanan Prima*. Jakarta: PT. ElexMedia Komputindo. Hlm 30.
- Basrowi & Suwandi. (2008). *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Jakarta: Rhineka Cipta.
- Basu Swasta Irawan. (2008). *Manajemen Pemasaran Modern*. Yogyakarta: Liberty. Hlm 119.
- Cook, Sarah. (2004). *Customer Care Excellence*. Jakarta: Penerbit PPM.
- Creswell, John. (1994). *Research Design: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Creswell J. W. (2016). *Research design pendekatan kualitatif, kuantitatif dan campuran*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Belajar.
- Gerson, Richard F. (2002). *Mengukur Kepuasan Pelanggan : Cetakan kedua*. Jakarta: PPM.
- Fitriana, E. S. (2019). Transformasi Kepemilikan dari Swasta ke Pemerintah: Implementasi Pelayanan Prima Universitas Siliwangi kepada Mahasiswa. *Jurnal Muara Ilmu Ekonomi dan Bisnis*, Vol.3, No.1, April, 209-2018.
- Freddy. (2017). *Teknik Membedah Kasus Bisnis Analisis SWOT Cara Perhitungan Bobot, Rating, dan OCAI*. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Handayani, R., & Keban, Y. T. (2004). *Analisis Kepuasan Pemakai Terhadap Pelayanan Perpustakaan Nasional Provinsi Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta= An Analysis on User Satisfaction of the Services Provided by National Library of Yogyakarta Province*.
- Kasmir. (2018). *Customer Services Excellent : Teori dan Praktik*. Depok: Rajawali Pers. Hlm. 47. 2
- Kotler, Philip. (2002). *Manajemen Pemasaran, Jilid 1*, Terj. Teguh Hendra. Jakarta: Prenhalindo. Hlm 246. 3
- Kotler, Philip dan Keller. (2007). *Manajemen Pemasaran, Jilid I*, Edisi. Kedua belas. Jakarta: PT. Indeks.
- Lovelock, Christopher. (2004). *Service Marketing and Management*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Lovelock, Christopher and Lauren Wright. (2004). *Principles of Service Marketing and Management*, 2nd ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ : Prentice Hall Inc.
- Majid Abdul, A. (2011). *Perencanaan Pembelajaran*. Bandung : Remaja. Rosdakarya. Hlm 61.
- Miles, M.B, Huberman, A.M, & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis, A Methods Sourcebook*, Edition 3. USA: Sage Publications. Terjemahan Tjetjep Rohindi Rohidi, UI-Press Hlm 12-14.
- Mujiasih, E. (2016). Hubungan Antara Komitmen Afektif Dengan Kompetensi Orientasi Layanan Pelanggan (Customer Service Orientation) pada Pramuniaga. *Jurnal Psikologi Undip* Vol 15 (2), 134-142.
- Nizar, Muhammad dan Badrus Soleh. (2017). "Pengaruh Pelayanan Prima (Service. Excellent) terhadap Kepuasan Nasabah". *Jurnal Ekonomi Islam*. Vol. 8. No. 2 .
- Nurrohmah, U. S. (2023). Analisis Kualitas Layanan Jasa Pendidikan terhadap Kepuasan Mahasiswa (Studi pada salah satu perguruan tinggi swasta di Yogyakarta). *Profit: Jurnal Manajemen, Bisnis dan Akuntansi*, 114-129.

- Ratnasari, I. (2016). Pengaruh Kualitas Pelayanan dan Citra Institusi terhadap Kepuasan Mahasiswa yang Berdampak pada Word of Mouth (Studi Kasus pada Mahasiswa Universitas Singaperbangsa Karawang). *Journal of Management and Business* Vol. 1 No.1, 51-63
- Sugiyono. (2019). *Metodelogi Penelitian Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif Dan R&D*. Bandung: ALFABETA.
- Suminar, R., & Apriliawati, M. (2017). Pelayanan Prima Pada Orang Tua Siswa Di Sempoa SIP TC Paramount Summarecon. *OJS Unpam* 4 (2), 1-25 (2017).
- Tanjung, R. C. (2019). Manajemen Pelayanan Prima dalam Meningkatkan Kepuasan Mahasiswa terhadap Layanan Pembelajaran (Studi Kasus di STIT Rakeyan Santang Karawang). *Jurnal Ilmiah MEA (Manajemen, Ekonomi & Akuntansi)* Volume 3 No.1, 234-242.
- Tjiptono, Fandy. (2007). *Strategi Pemasaran, Cet. Ketiga*. Jawa Timur: Banyumedia Publishing. Hlm 349. 2.
- Yin R.K. and M.K. Gwaltney. (1981a). "Knowledge utilization as a networking process." *Knowledge* 2 (June): 555-580.
- Yin, R. K. (1981b). The Case Study Crisis: Some Answers. *Administrative Science Quarterly* (ed. 26 Mar).
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (4th Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.