

EVALUATION OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MIDDLE CLASS SUNDAY SCHOOL CURRICULUM WITH THE CIPP APPROACH AT THE GPSDI EFATA AMBON CONGREGATION

Sifera Sampe Liling

Postgraduate Student of Institut Agama Kristen Negeri Ambon
Author email correspondence: sampelilingsifera@gmail.com

Herly Janet Lesilolo

Institut Agama Kristen Negeri Ambon

Yowelna Tarumaselly

Institut Agama Kristen Negeri Ambon

Sephliano Elrianto Maxnusiz Sahureka

Institut Agama Kristen Negeri Ambon

Dritin Isfhanavia

Universitas Gajayana Malang

Abstract

This study evaluates the implementation of the Middle Grade Sunday School Curriculum at GPSDI Jemaat Efata Ambon using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) approach. The evaluation was conducted using a mixed method, combining quantitative data from 32 students through questionnaires and qualitative data through in-depth interviews, observations, and documentation of teachers, administrators, parents, and students. The evaluation results indicate that the learning context and the suitability of the curriculum to the needs of children aged 9–11 years still need adjustments to be more relevant and participatory. Input aspects such as teaching materials, media, teacher competency, and infrastructure are in the inadequate category, thus limiting the effectiveness of the learning process which tends to be lecture-dominated and minimal interactivity. Product evaluation shows growth in faith, skills in leading prayer and praise, but mastery of memorized verses is not consistent. These findings emphasize the need for more adaptive curriculum improvements, teacher competency enhancement, utilization of learning media, and integration of formative evaluation to support the growth of faith, character, and students' skills on an ongoing basis. This study provides a practical contribution to the development of Sunday Schools in Pentecostal churches and strengthens the understanding of CIPP-based curriculum evaluation in Christian education.

Keywords: *Sunday School, Intermediate Class Curriculum, CIPP Evaluation, Christian Education, Curriculum Implementation.*

INTRODUCTION

The development of students in the Middle Class Sunday School at church plays a crucial role in shaping children's character and faith from an early age. However, in reality, curriculum implementation often falls short of optimal levels because

evaluation of the curriculum and learning practices is rarely conducted systematically. Static learning materials, monotonous methods, and the lack of evaluative feedback make it difficult for teachers to motivate students and direct learning toward established objectives. As a result, the faith education process tends to be an administrative routine with no real impact on the growth of faith and character in the middle class. In the context of Christian education, this has the potential to undermine the function of Sunday School as a strategic forum for faith formation for the younger generation. Curriculum evaluation is a crucial instrument for assessing the alignment of the written curriculum with practice, identifying gaps, and providing a basis for continuous improvement (Provus, 1971; Glatthorn et al., 2005)

Evaluation of curriculum implementation in Christian education is not merely administrative but also has pedagogical and theological significance. An unevaluated curriculum risks becoming a formal document unable to guide the learning process, resulting in the teaching of conventional, non-contextualized, and less relevant to students' needs. Based on the theory of curriculum relevance, educational success is determined by the ability of curriculum content to adapt to the social, cultural, and developmental environments of children (Tyler, 1949). Without an evaluation mechanism, the curriculum implemented in Sunday Schools has the potential to lose its meaning, and students lack learning experiences that support balanced development of faith, morals, social, and emotional well-being. Furthermore, the educational systems approach emphasizes that the curriculum is a component that interacts with educational inputs, processes, and outputs (Ornstein & Hunkins, 2009; Pidarta, 2007). Without ongoing evaluation, the flow of this system becomes uncontrolled, resulting in a decline in the quality of learning, student motivation, and the resulting competencies.

Previous research has focused extensively on Christian education evaluation, but with varying focuses. Ritonga & Rantung (2018) evaluated Christian Religious Education (CRE) in families at the GKRI Diaspora Congregation in Cawang, East Jakarta, and found that regular evaluation of family CRE elements is crucial, including the involvement of parents and family members in guiding children. Hutaapea (2019) emphasized the importance of CRE teachers' understanding of the nature of learning evaluation and the 2013 Curriculum, as a proper understanding facilitates the design of effective evaluation instruments. Gulo et al., (2020) examined CRE evaluation at the Bethel Indonesia Church Sunday School in the Growth Congregation in Tangerang, Banten, and demonstrated the need for attention to the implementation of faith education programs in the field. Sianipar et al., (2023) evaluated Sunday Schools using the CSE-UCLA model, which emphasizes the effectiveness of non-formal education program evaluation procedures. Prisilia (2024) highlighted the teaching competencies of Sunday School teachers in discipleship ministry and found that deficiencies in teaching require ongoing coaching, training, and guidance.

From the review, it is clear that previous research has emphasized the evaluation of CRE in general, teacher competency, or family context, but there has been no study that specifically evaluates the implementation of the Middle Grade Sunday School Curriculum in Pentecostal churches, especially in the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation. This void is a significant research gap, because the middle grade Sunday School has unique student characteristics, being at the developmental stage of children aged 9–11 years, so it requires a contextual, participatory learning approach, and oriented towards the growth of faith and character. An unevaluated curriculum can cause a mismatch between learning objectives, materials, methods, and results achieved in the field. Evaluation is an important tool to assess the suitability of the curriculum, the readiness of resources, the quality of the learning process, and the impact on the growth of faith and character of students, as well as being the basis for developing a more adaptive curriculum.

Based on the background and previous research, this study formulates the main problems as follows: first, to what extent does the Middle Class Sunday School curriculum match the needs of students and the service context at GPSDI Jemaat Efata? Second, how are the readiness and availability of resources, including teachers, teaching materials, infrastructure, and organizational support in supporting the implementation of the curriculum? Third, how is the process of implementing the Middle Class Sunday School learning according to the applicable curriculum? Fourth, what are the results and impacts of curriculum implementation on the growth of faith, character, and participation of Middle Class students at GPSDI Jemaat Efata? This problem formulation is designed to comprehensively assess the curriculum using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) approach, so that the evaluation not only highlights weaknesses, but also provides a basis for curriculum improvement and development.

The purpose of this study is to describe the suitability of the Middle Class Sunday School curriculum to the needs of students, the goals of church service, and the development of the times; analyze the adequacy and readiness of curriculum input, including teaching staff, teaching materials, learning methods, and supporting facilities; evaluate the quality of the implementation of the learning process based on curriculum implementation; assess learning outcomes and the impact of the curriculum on the growth of faith and student participation; and provide recommendations for curriculum improvements to improve the quality of youth development.

This research is expected to provide theoretical contributions to the development of church ministry curriculum evaluation and Christian education practices, as well as practical benefits for churches, Sunday School teachers, students, and researchers. For churches, the research results will form the basis for considerations regarding the improvement and development of Sunday School curricula. For teachers, the research will help improve the quality of learning strategies

and services to middle school students. For students, the research is expected to enhance relevant, interactive faith learning experiences and foster Christian character. Academically, this research adds to the literature on CIPP-based curriculum evaluation in the context of Christian education, while also serving as a reference for further studies focusing on Sunday School development in Pentecostal churches and other non-formal educational contexts.

Thus, this study not only emphasizes the importance of evaluating curriculum implementation but also emphasizes the relationship between evaluation and learning improvement, strengthening teacher capacity, and developing an adaptive curriculum. This research is a strategic step to ensure that the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum can support the church's mission of forming a generation of young people who are faithful, have character, and are able to become witnesses of Christ in real life. Curriculum evaluation is expected to be a reflective and ongoing practice that bridges the gap between the written curriculum and learning practices in the field, and ensures the continuity of quality faith education in the church.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a mixed method approach, combining quantitative and qualitative data in one evaluative design. The quantitative approach was used to measure data obtained through questionnaires, while the qualitative approach was chosen to deeply understand the reality of the implementation of the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum at GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation. The strategy applied was concurrent triangulation, where quantitative and qualitative data collection was carried out simultaneously or in parallel, then analyzed separately but complementary. This type of evaluative research uses the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model developed by Stufflebeam to assess the suitability between the curriculum, learning implementation, and the achieved results. Thus, this study not only describes the existing conditions but also provides a basis for recommendations for improving the curriculum and learning strategies in the Middle Class Sunday School.

The research location was at GPSDI Jemaat Efata Ambon, specifically in the middle grade with participants aged 9–11 years. The quantitative sample was determined using a census or saturated sampling technique, so that the entire population of 32 children were used as respondents to ensure comprehensive representation. Qualitative subjects were determined purposively, including Sunday School teachers (3 people), Sunday School administrators (2 people), parents of students as triangulation, and 5 children as verification of results and participatory observation. Data collection was carried out through questionnaires, in-depth interviews, field observations, and documentation such as curriculum, student worksheets, schedules, and evaluation reports. Quantitative data were analyzed descriptively using simple statistics such as mean, median, mode, frequency distribution, and percentage, while qualitative data were analyzed thematically

through reduction, presentation, drawing conclusions, and triangulation to ensure the validity of the findings and obtain a comprehensive picture of the implementation of the Middle Grade Sunday School curriculum.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result/Findings

Quantitative Research Results of the CIPP Evaluation

1. Context Evaluation

A quantitative evaluation of the contextual aspects of the implementation of the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum at GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation shows variations in students' perceptions regarding the suitability of the curriculum to learning needs, the context of church services, and children's social and emotional experiences. Based on the questionnaire data, the minimum score given by students was 2.00, while the maximum score reached 10.00, with an average (mean) of 7.28. The frequency distribution shows that the majority of students gave scores of 7 (21.9%) and 8 (28.1%), while extreme scores, namely 2.00 and 10.00, were only given by 3.1% and 12.5% of respondents. These results indicate that students' perceptions of the contextual aspects tend to be in the moderate category.

These findings indicate that the curriculum has generally been adapted to the goal of fostering children's faith and character, but its implementation is still not fully relevant to the needs, abilities, and experiences of students. In other words, although the curriculum framework is in place, its implementation in the field has not fully taken into account individual differences, learning preferences, and social dynamics of middle-aged children. Therefore, the results of this quantitative evaluation emphasize the importance of adapting materials, learning strategies, and learning activities to be more contextual and responsive to the social, emotional, and spiritual conditions of students, so that curriculum implementation can be more effective and meaningful in fostering children's faith and character growth.

2. Input Evaluation

The results of a quantitative evaluation of the input aspect in the implementation of the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum at the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation indicate that the readiness of resources, teaching staff, teaching materials, and supporting facilities remains variable. Based on the questionnaire data analysis, the minimum score given by respondents was 4.00, while the maximum score reached 9.00, with an average (mean) of 5.59. The frequency distribution shows that the lowest score of 4.00 was given by 7 respondents (21.9%), while the highest score of 9.00 was given by only 1 respondent (3.1%). The majority of students gave a score of 5.00, namely 12 respondents (37.5%), while scores of 7.00 and 8.00 were found at lower frequencies.

Based on the score category using the equal interval method, the average value of 5.59 indicates that the input aspect is in the insufficient category. This finding indicates that although some resources and teaching staff are available, there are significant deficiencies that affect the effectiveness of curriculum implementation. These deficiencies include limited learning media, supplementary teaching materials, and infrastructure that support creative and interactive learning. Therefore, the results of this quantitative evaluation emphasize the need to improve the quality of input through teacher training, enrichment of teaching materials, and the provision of relevant learning media, so that learning in the Intermediate class can run more optimally, enjoyable, and in accordance with the needs of students.

3. Process Evaluation

The results of the quantitative evaluation of the process aspect of the implementation of the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum at the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation revealed varying student perceptions regarding the implementation of learning activities. Statistical data showed that the minimum score given by respondents was 3.00 and the maximum score was 14.00, with an average (mean) of 10.19. The frequency distribution showed that the lowest score of 3.00 was given by two respondents (6.3%), while the highest score of 14.00 was given by one respondent (3.1%). The majority of respondents gave scores of 9.00, 10.00, and 11.00, each representing five respondents, while the other scores were less frequent.

Using the equal-interval method (range 3.67), these results place the process aspect in the moderate category. This finding indicates that the implementation of Sunday School learning in the Middle class is generally running according to plan, but still faces limitations in terms of active student involvement, interactivity, and variety of teaching strategies. The average score in the moderate category emphasizes the need for improvements in the application of more participatory, reflective, and contextual learning methods, including the use of visual media and interactive activities that support children's understanding of faith and character development. Thus, although teachers have implemented learning according to the curriculum, the teaching process still requires strengthening to achieve optimal effectiveness in supporting the growth of students' faith and character.

4. Product Evaluation

Quantitative data processing results for the product aspect were obtained from secondary data from 2024, including semester 1 and 2 exam scores, memorization verse scores for semester 1 and 2, and praise and prayer leadership skills for semester 1 and 2. The analysis was conducted to assess the impact of implementing the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum at the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation on children's faith growth, material mastery, and skills.

The first semester exam scores showed a minimum score of 20.00 and a maximum score of 80.00 with a mean of 59.22 and a standard deviation of 20.32. The frequency distribution showed that the most frequent scores obtained by students were 60.00 and 80.00, respectively, by 31.3% of students. Meanwhile, in the second semester, the minimum score was 20.00 and the maximum was 100.00 with a mean of 73.43 and an average increase of 24.02%. Based on the score category with the equal interval method, the results of the first and second semester exams were in the moderate category, indicating an increase in mastery of the material during one year of curriculum implementation.

For the verse memorization indicator, scores in semester 1 ranged from 0.00 to 25.00, with an average of 10.97 and a standard deviation of 8.60, falling within the moderate category. However, in semester 2, scores ranged from 0.00 to 10.00, with an average of 3.87, a decrease compared to semester 1 with a percentage change of -64.67%, placing them in the poor category. This finding indicates that children's verse memorization abilities do not show consistent improvement.

The worship leadership skills indicator showed scores in semester 1 ranging from 4.00 to 15.00, with an average of 10.34, while in semester 2, scores ranged from 4.00 to 17.00, with an average of 11.63. The 12.39% increase in worship leadership skills placed the scores in the moderate category for both semesters. These results indicate a gradual development in children's worship leadership abilities.

For the prayer leadership skills indicator, scores in semester 1 ranged from 4.00 to 16.00 with an average of 11.50, while in semester 2 they ranged from 4.00 to 20.00 with an average of 14.03. A 22.01% increase indicates significant skill improvement, with semester 1 falling in the moderate category and semester 2 falling in the good category. These findings demonstrate that most children experienced positive development in their prayer leadership skills during the curriculum implementation.

Overall, the quantitative results of the product evaluation indicate that the implementation of the Middle Grade Sunday School Curriculum has had a positive impact on improving material mastery, worship leadership skills, and prayer, although verse memorization skills have not shown consistency. This underscores the need for more effective learning and evaluation mechanisms to optimally support children's internalization of faith and worship skills.

Qualitative Research Results of the CIPP Evaluation

1. Context Evaluation

Based on in-depth interviews, field observations, and documentation, the contextual aspects of the implementation of the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum at the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation revealed several important findings related to student needs, the church's vision and mission, children's ministry programs, the curriculum's relevance to current developments, learning objectives, and the learning environment.

First, the needs of middle-aged students (9–11 years old) at GPSDI Efata demonstrate varied and interactive learning characteristics. Field observations indicate that middle-aged children require learning based on short stories, real-life examples, activities, games, and visual media. Learning that consists solely of long lectures without real-life activities tends to cause children to lose focus, become sleepy, or chat with their friends. Sunday School teachers emphasized that learning strategies need to be adapted to children's cognitive and social development. One teacher stated that children will be more enthusiastic if learning is delivered using a variety of methods, humor, and interactive games. Furthermore, middle-aged children also demonstrate a high social need; they want to be accepted, play together, and learn to build relationships with peers, which significantly supports their motivation and understanding of their faith. However, some children, especially boys, tend to be shy and passive when asked to perform in front of the class, for example when singing or performing movements during learning activities. These findings emphasize that learning approaches must balance interactivity, social needs, and children's individual characteristics.

Second, the church's vision and mission and children's ministry programs become a conceptual framework for children's faith formation. GPSDI Efata has a spiritual vision to form a congregation that is pleasing to God and imitates the character of Christ, which is translated into Sunday School through teaching the Word of God, developing Christian character, and worship activities such as Sunday School services every Sunday, shoot services, and special retreats for Intermediate classes. Even though the curriculum used comes from the GPSDI Maluku Sunday School Bureau, the coaching values taught are still in line with the vision of the local church, covering themes such as following Jesus, living according to Christ's example, loving others, loyalty, humility, holy living, and being a witness for Christ. Teachers also understand the purpose of their teaching as an effort to instill Christian values so that children become role models, salt and light in their environment.

Third, regarding the curriculum's suitability to congregational needs and current developments, field findings indicate a discrepancy. The Regional Bureau's curriculum is relatively simple and does not provide adequate pedagogical guidance for middle-aged children, making it difficult for teachers to implement the curriculum creatively and contextually. This deficiency is compounded by the lack of visual media and learning activity guidelines, preventing children from fully learning using a variety of methods tailored to their needs.

Fourth, the learning objectives in the Intermediate class have not been specifically formulated at each meeting, are general in nature, and do not include clear competency indicators. Based on interviews, the primary goal of learning is to foster children's knowledge of Christ, understanding God's Word according to their age-appropriate developmental stage, and being able to apply Christian values in their

daily lives. Teachers hope that children will not only understand God's Word but also live it as a foundation of faith, so that they can be role models in their daily lives.

Fifth, the learning environment at GPSDI Efata is generally supportive of Sunday School implementation, but it is not yet optimal. The shared church space for various classes, the relatively large number of children, and the noise between groups present challenges. Teachers require additional time to discipline the children before lessons begin. Although parents support their attendance, communication between teachers and parents is almost non-existent, limiting a holistic understanding of children's needs.

Overall, qualitative findings on the context aspect indicate a gap between the needs of students, the church's vision and mission, children's ministry programs, and the learning environment, and the Sunday School curriculum used. The Intermediate Curriculum, issued by the Regional Bureau, is not fully adequate to meet the learning needs of children aged 9–11, who require varied, interactive, and contextual learning. The lack of pedagogical guidelines, the absence of visual media, and the absence of specific learning objectives at each meeting make it difficult for teachers to implement the curriculum effectively. This gap underscores the importance of curriculum evaluation to ensure that children's faith development is optimal, contextual, and relevant to current developments.

2. Input Evaluation

Based on findings from interviews, field observations, and documentation, the input aspects of implementing the Middle Grade Sunday School Curriculum at the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation revealed various challenges that impacted learning effectiveness. First, the curriculum used had a basic structure containing an annual theme, weekly topics, Bible chapter references, story titles, simple activities, and memory verses. This structure demonstrated a sequential flow of topics, but the curriculum lacked essential components, such as learning objectives, achievement indicators, methodological guidelines, learning media, and child development evaluations. This made it difficult for teachers to understand the main focus of each Bible passage and design contextualized learning. As stated by the Sunday School coordinator: "The curriculum only provides verses and chapters, but it doesn't provide the core message of what is being conveyed" (CHT). Sunday school teachers also emphasized that this limitation forced them to independently seek additional references to deliver the material accurately (ARR, MLN, ELL).

Second, regarding teaching materials, teachers rely solely on the Bible and a simple curriculum from the Sunday School office, which lacks detailed teaching guidelines. Teachers often have to develop their own teaching materials and delivery methods to suit the needs of the Middle School children. This demonstrates the dependence of learning on individual teacher creativity. Third, teacher competency also poses a challenge, as most teachers are volunteers who have not received formal

training before teaching. Some teachers learn only through experience observing other teachers or participating in classroom practice (ARR, MLN, ELL).

Fourth, institutional support and infrastructure are also limited. Although there is cash funding from offerings and special programs, allocations for weekly teaching materials are suboptimal. Teachers often bear the costs of preparing learning media themselves. Furthermore, limited time for teachers, especially those working full-time, presents an additional barrier to teaching preparation. Fifth, the children's ministry organization has a clear structure and a regular teacher schedule, but training for volunteers is not yet available, so they can only participate in teaching practice with senior teachers before being appointed as official teachers.

Overall, these qualitative findings indicate that the input aspect of implementing the Middle Grade Sunday School Curriculum still faces various limitations, including in terms of curriculum, teaching materials, teacher competency, and supporting facilities and infrastructure. This situation confirms that the available input does not fully support the achievement of optimal, creative, and contextual learning for students.

3. Process Evaluation

Based on interviews, field observations, and documentation, several findings were uncovered regarding the implementation of the Middle Grade Sunday School Curriculum at the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation. First, the implementation was still inconsistent with the curriculum plan. Observations showed that some Middle Grade teachers did not always follow the topics and activities outlined in the curriculum. Activities designed in the curriculum were often only partially implemented or not implemented at all. Some teachers chose to deliver the material independently based on their personal understanding or additional references, resulting in differences in implementation between teachers. This indicates a gap between the curriculum plan and practice in the field.

Second, the teaching strategies and methods used tend to be dominated by lectures. This method limits learning variation and decreases students' interest and participation. Middle-grade students admitted that long lectures bored them and made them sleepy. In contrast, interactive activities, such as games, quizzes, and singing together, were shown to significantly increase student enthusiasm and engagement. This finding underscores the importance of using more participatory methods and contextual activities to enhance learning effectiveness.

Third, coordination between teachers in implementing the learning process is still minimal. Routine meetings focus more on administrative aspects or general programs, while pedagogical discussions, teaching methods, and child development are rarely addressed. This situation results in less than optimal implementation of learning strategies and faith development consistently.

Fourth, the timing and schedule of activities were less than ideal. Observations showed that Sunday school activities often ran 10–30 minutes late due to waiting for the general service to finish, resulting in lessons sometimes exceeding the planned schedule.

Overall, the implementation of the Sunday school curriculum in the Middle grades revealed several fundamental weaknesses, including the dominance of lectures, low student participation, the application of materials outside the curriculum, the lack of implementation of planned activities, minimal teacher coordination, and inconsistent activity schedules. These findings underscore the need to strengthen learning strategies, increase teacher collaboration, and optimize time management to make the learning process more interactive, participatory, and effective in supporting children's faith and character growth.

4. Product Evaluation

The results of this qualitative research on the product aspect of the implementation of the Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum at the GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation were obtained through interviews, observations, and documentation. Findings include children's learning outcomes, behavioral and spiritual changes, the application of Christian values, parental involvement, and the effectiveness of the Sunday School program. First, Children's Learning Outcomes. Evaluation of children's learning outcomes was conducted simply, in the form of written tests at the mid- and end-of-semester, and observations of children's active participation in prayer, leading worship, and memorizing verses. Sunday school teachers revealed that the curriculum did not provide clear indicators of success, so assessments were conducted independently by the local Sunday school. Points awarded for active participation, verse memorization, and prayer leadership were then collected and used to award rewards at the end of the year. As the teachers explained: "The evaluation points are collected to be used as rewards for diligent Sunday school students at the end of the year" (MLN). This indicates that although evaluations are conducted routinely, they are still ad hoc and not standardized, thus limiting the measurability of learning success.

Second, Changes in Children's Behavior and Spirituality. Qualitative data shows positive changes in children's attitudes and behavior. Children who were previously shy are now more confident in praying and leading worship, and are beginning to incorporate spiritual habits into their daily lives, such as praying before meals and bedtime. Parents also report an increase in their children's interest in church activities and the Bible, as well as the application of Christian values in social interactions: "It's clear. As long as he enjoys Sunday school, he's changed. He knows that when he eats he has to pray, when he goes to bed he has to pray, when he goes to school he has to pray" (Ot2). However, parental involvement in evaluating their children's

development is almost non-existent, limiting the sustainability of faith formation at home.

Third, the GPSDI Efata Sunday School Program is run routinely through Sunday services, Tunas services, and annual retreats. The activity structure is clear, beginning with a joint worship service, class division, preaching, and closing activities. This pattern supports the formation of children's spiritual habits and facilitates teachers' implementation of weekly activities. However, the program's effectiveness remains limited because the curriculum used is simple and lacks pedagogical guidelines, visual media, or measurable learning objectives. Teachers often rely on their own creativity and initiative in delivering the message. Furthermore, limited learning space, large student populations, noise levels, and minimal communication with parents also hinder the optimization of the learning process.

Overall, the curriculum implementation results demonstrate two sides. On the one hand, there is tangible growth in children's faith and skills, including courage in prayer, social awareness, and the application of Christian values. On the other hand, evaluation of learning outcomes remains rudimentary and unstandardized, and parental involvement is very limited. The effectiveness of the Sunday School program is heavily influenced by the quality of the curriculum, learning space management, and parental engagement strategies. These findings underscore the need for strengthened evaluation systems, a more comprehensive curriculum, and synergy between teachers and parents to ensure consistent and sustainable faith development in children.

Analysis/Discussion

Evaluation Analysis of CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) for the Implementation of the Sunday School Curriculum for the Middle Class of GSPDI Efata Ambon

The evaluation of the implementation of the Sunday School Curriculum for the Middle Class at GSPDI Efata Ambon was conducted using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model, which allows for a comprehensive analysis of the curriculum's suitability to student needs, input readiness, the quality of the learning process, and the achieved outcomes. Based on quantitative and qualitative data, the CIPP evaluation provides a holistic overview of the curriculum's strengths, weaknesses, and needs for improvement.

First, Contextual Evaluation. Context analysis shows that the Sunday School curriculum has not been fully developed based on a systematic analysis of student needs. Qualitative evaluation through interviews and observations revealed that curriculum planning refers more to teacher habits and Regional Bureau curriculum documents, without considering the characteristics of the Middle Ages, the stage of faith development, or the specific learning needs of children (Ornstein & Hunkins, 2013; Tyler, 1949). This results in low learning relevance, so that the development of children's faith, attitudes, and biblical understanding cannot be clearly measured.

The church's vision and mission, although generally formulated, have not been integrated into operational curriculum documents, resulting in normative and poorly structured guidance for children's faith and character development. Quantitative evaluation of contextual aspects indicates the need for structuring objectives, indicators, and implementation guidelines to make the curriculum more relevant, adaptive, and aligned with the socio-cultural dynamics of children and the church's vision and mission (Pazmiño, 2008; Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2017; Taba, 1962).

Furthermore, the learning environment, which accommodates 32 middle-grade students out of a total of 60 participants, presents significant classroom management challenges. Space limitations and an unbalanced teacher-to-child ratio result in low levels of active engagement, personal interaction, and learning differentiation, as emphasized in constructivist and child development theories (Fosnot, 2013; Piaget, 1952; Vygotsky, 1978). Overall, the context evaluation emphasized the need for student-centered curriculum development, the integration of the church's written vision and mission, and pedagogical adaptation to child characteristics and local conditions.

Second, Input Evaluation. The quantitative evaluation results show an average input score of 5.59, categorized as insufficient. Quantitative and qualitative analyses indicate that input components such as teaching materials, teacher competencies, media, and infrastructure are still limited. The curriculum provides a sequential flow of topics but lacks specific learning objectives, achievement indicators, strategies, and clear evaluation (Ornstein & Hunkins, 2013; Tyler, 1949).

Available teaching materials are minimalistic, thus not serving as adequate pedagogical guides. Theological teachers' competencies are quite good, but their pedagogical and child psychology skills remain weak due to a lack of ongoing training. Simple media and infrastructure do not support active and participatory learning, while financial constraints and organizational readiness hinder the optimization of input (Bush, 2011; Tilaar, 2012).

Qualitative findings confirm this, with teachers reporting difficulty adapting materials and methods to children's needs, as well as a lack of media support and evaluation guidelines. Theoretically, limited input hinders the creation of meaningful, innovative, and sustainable learning experiences (Benson, 2001; Mayer, 2009). Therefore, strengthening input comprehensively is a crucial prerequisite for improving the quality of Sunday school learning.

Third, Process Evaluation. The average process evaluation score was 10.18, falling into the moderate category. Quantitative and qualitative analyses showed that although the learning process was routine and structured, there was a mismatch between teacher practice and the curriculum plan. Teachers tended to predominantly use lecture methods, resulting in children being less actively involved in reflection, discussion, and practical faith experiences (Fosnot, 2013; L. S. Vygotsky, 1980; Piaget, 1952).

Lack of collaboration between teachers limits the exchange of pedagogical strategies and learning innovations. Qualitative evaluations indicate that teachers find it difficult to systematically monitor children's progress, and limited media and infrastructure further weaken learning effectiveness. Curriculum implementation theory emphasizes the importance of teachers consistently following curriculum guidelines to achieve learning objectives (Fullan & Park, 1981; Tyler, 1949).

The findings emphasize the need to strengthen more interactive methods, teacher collaboration, and adequate media utilization so that the learning process is more effective, participatory, and supports the development of children's faith, character, and social skills.

The findings emphasize the need to strengthen more interactive methods, teacher collaboration, and adequate media utilization so that the learning process is more effective, participatory, and supports the development of children's faith, character, and social skills.

Teachers' satisfaction with the flexibility of the material is quite high, but they complain about the lack of methodological guidance and evaluation. Parents assess the positive moral impact on children, but their involvement at home remains limited. Children are less motivated when the teaching method is predominantly lecture-based and lacks interactive activities, resulting in suboptimal internalization of religious values (Fosnot, 2013; Sardiman, 2012).

Theoretically, the combination of limitations in objectives, methods, media, and evaluation contradicts the principles of a competency-based curriculum that emphasizes the integration of planning, process, and evaluation (Ornstein & Hunkins, 2013; Taba, 1962; Tyler, 1949). Product evaluations emphasize the need to strengthen the curriculum, method guides, learning media, and evaluation systems so that Sunday Schools are more effective, sustainable, and have a real impact on the formation of children's faith, character, and spirituality.

Based on the CIPP evaluation, the GSPDI Efata Middle Class Sunday School Curriculum has strengths in its sequential topic structure and teacher commitment, but experiences significant weaknesses in the clarity of objectives, achievement indicators, methods, media, infrastructure, teacher pedagogical competence, and evaluation system. These limitations hinder the achievement of meaningful learning outcomes, the internalization of Christian values, and the development of children's spirituality. Therefore, comprehensive improvements are needed in curriculum design, teacher competency enhancement, media and infrastructure optimization, and systematic evaluation integration to make Sunday School learning more effective, structured, and sustainable.

Implications of the Results of the Curriculum Implementation Evaluation for Christian Education

The evaluation of the implementation of the Sunday School Curriculum for the Middle Class at the GPSDI Efata Congregation reveals several important implications for the practice of Christian education in the church. First, the findings emphasize that Christian education needs to be understood as a deliberate, planned, and reflective process, not simply a teaching routine. Qualitative data indicates that learning in the field often occurs as a routine service activity without a systematic evaluation mechanism, resulting in suboptimal achievement of the goal of developing children's Christian faith and character. This emphasizes the need for a pedagogical approach consciously designed to support students' holistic faith growth.

Second, the context evaluation results indicate that the curriculum is not fully based on an analysis of the developmental needs of children aged 9–11. A curriculum that is not contextualized with children's social, emotional, and spiritual realities risks losing relevance and meaning. The implications of these findings emphasize that Christian education needs to prioritize an analysis of students' contexts as the basis for formulating objectives, strategies, and learning materials, just as Jesus Christ, in His ministry, always adapted the delivery of teachings to the background, needs, and level of understanding of His listeners (Fosnot, 2013; Lebar, 2016).

Third, the input and preparedness of Sunday School teachers, as well as the church's structural support, still require strengthening. Quantitative evaluations revealed limitations in teachers' pedagogical competencies and learning media, while qualitative evaluations highlighted the need for ongoing training and consistent coaching. The implications of these findings emphasize that Christian education requires educators who simultaneously act as servants of faith and pedagogically competent teachers, supported by a responsive and sustainable church organizational structure (Benson, 2001; Darling-Hammond, 2017).

Fourth, process evaluations revealed a predominance of lecture methods and minimal collaboration between teachers, resulting in low student engagement and limited reflective interaction. This implies that the Christian learning process must emphasize relational and transformative dimensions, with teachers utilizing formative evaluation as a means of assessing student responses, guiding faith growth, and continuously adapting pedagogical strategies (Fosnot, 2013; Hargreaves & Fullan, 2012).

Fifth, the product evaluation confirms that the curriculum's impact on the growth of children's faith, character, and Christian practices cannot yet be clearly measured. The discrepancy between learning objectives, processes, and outcomes demonstrates the need for evaluations oriented toward spiritual outcomes, not simply measuring activity or attendance. Christian education should emphasize the formation of concrete disciples of Christ in everyday life, so that evaluation becomes an integral

part of discipleship, not an additional administrative activity (Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2017; Taba, 1962).

Overall, the implications of this evaluation confirm that Christian education, particularly in the Sunday School context, requires a church commitment to developing a contextualized curriculum, equipped educators, a reflective learning process, and ongoing evaluation. Curriculum evaluation serves as a strategic tool to ensure alignment between the church's vision, the goals of faith education, and on-the-ground learning practices. It also serves as a tool for theological and pedagogical reflection for the growth of faith education ministries. Thus, the evaluation results provide a conceptual foundation for curriculum renewal and the formulation of practical recommendations that support the ongoing development of disciples of Christ.

CONCLUSION

Based on the evaluation results of the implementation of the Middle Grade Sunday School Curriculum at GPSDI Efata Ambon Congregation, it can be concluded that the curriculum conceptually includes the goal of fostering children's faith and character, but it is not yet fully measurable, contextual, and adaptive to the development of middle-aged children. The learning process tends to focus on traditional delivery of material, with minimal interactive methods and formative evaluation, so that children's involvement and internalization of faith values are not optimal. In addition, teacher readiness, media availability, and church structural support are still limited, so that the implementation of the curriculum does not fully reflect the spiritual growth and character of students in a sustainable manner. These findings emphasize the need to understand Christian education as a reflective, contextual, and transformative pedagogical process, and place evaluation as an integral part of children's discipleship.

Based on the research findings, it is recommended that local churches develop clear objectives and curriculum documents, develop comprehensive implementation guidelines, and establish achievement indicators and learning strategies tailored to children's needs. Continuous teacher training, strengthening pedagogical competencies, and developing creative and reflective learning methods should be prioritized to improve the quality of the learning process. Furthermore, a participatory and ongoing evaluation system for spiritual learning outcomes, involving teachers, parents, and church administrators, is essential for monitoring children's faith and character growth. At the synod level or the national GPSDI institution, it is necessary to encourage the development of an adaptive national curriculum, the development of teacher training modules, and cross-congregational supervision. These steps are expected to make Sunday School a strategic, contextual, and transformative vehicle for faith formation for the church's younger generation.

REFERENCES

Benson, W. S. (2001). Philosophical Foundations of Christian Education. In M. J. Anthony (Ed.), *Introducing Christian Education: Foundations for the twenty-first Century* (p. 304). Baker Academic.

Bush, T. (2011). *Theories of Educational Leadership and Management* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.

Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). *Teacher education around the world: What can we learn from international practice?* Routledge.

Fosnot, C. T. (2013). *Constructivism: Theory, Perspectives, and Practice*. Teachers College Press.

Fullan, M., & Park, P. (1981). *Curriculum Implementation: A Literature Analysis*. Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.

Glatthorn, A. A., Boschee, F. A., & Whitehead, B. M. (2005). *Curriculum Leadership: Development and Implementation*. SAGE Publications.

Gulo, N., Studi, P., Pendidikan, M., Kristen, A., Pascasarjana, P., & Indonesia, U. K. (2020). *GEREJA BETHEL INDONESIA JEMAAT GROWTH*.

Hargreaves, A., & Fullan, M. (2012). *Professional Capital: Transforming Teaching in Every School*. Teachers College Press.

Hutapea, R. H. (2019). Evaluasi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Kristen Pada Kurikulum 2013. *Jurnal Ilmiah Religiosity Entity Humanity (JIREH)*, 1(1), 18–30.

L. S. Vygotsky. (1980). *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. Harvard University Press.

Lebar, L. E. (2016). *Education That Is Christian*. Gandum Mas.

Mayer, R. E. (2009). *Multimedia learning*. Cambridge University Press.

Ornstein, A. C., & Hunkins, F. P. (2009). *Curriculum: Foundations, Principles, and Issues* (5th ed.). Pearson.

Ornstein, A. C., & Hunkins, F. P. (2013). *Curriculum: Foundations, Principles, and Issues* (6th ed.). Pearson.

Pazmiño, R. W. (2008). *Foundational Issues in Christian Education: An Introduction in Evangelical Perspective* (3rd ed.). Baker Academic.

Piaget, J. (1952). *The Origins of Intelligence in Children*. Norton.

Pidarta, M. (2007). *Landasan Kependidikan* (ke-2). Rineka Cipta.

Prisilia, R. (2024). *Evaluasi Kompetensi Mengajar Guru Sekolah Minggu dalam Tugas Pemuridan di Gereja Toraja Jemaat Ukka'*. Institut Agama Kristen Negeri (IAKN) Toraja.

Provus, M. M. (1971). *Discrepancy Evaluation: For Educational Program Improvement and Assessment*. McCutchan Publishing Corporation.

Ritonga, N., & Rantung, D. A. (2018). Evaluasi Implementasi Pak Keluarga Di Gkri Jemaat Diaspora Cawang Jakarta Timur. *Jurnal Shanan*, 2(2), 107–130. <https://doi.org/10.33541/shanan.v2i2.1538>

Sardiman, A. M. (2012). *Interaksi dan Motivasi Belajar Mengajar*. Rajawali Pers.

Sianipar, D., Sairwona, W., & Boiliu, E. R. (2023). Evaluasi Program Sekolah Minggu Dengan Menggunakan Model Evaluasi CSE-UCLA. *DUNAMIS: Jurnal Teologi Dan Pendidikan Kristiani*, 8(2), 522–540. <https://doi.org/10.30648/dun.v8i2.1073>

Stufflebeam, D. L., & Zhang, G. (2017). *The CIPP Evaluation Model: How to Evaluate for Improvement and Accountability*. The Guilford Press.

Taba, H. (1962). *Curriculum development. Theory and Practice. Foundations, process,*

design, and strategy for planning both primary and secondary curriculum. Harcourt, Brace and World.

Tilaar, H. A. R. (2012). *Manajemen Pendidikan Nasional*. Rineka Cipta.

Tyler, R. W. (1949). *Basic Principles of Curriculum and Instruction*. The University of Chicago Press.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. MA: Harvard University Press.